

Company

24 June 2010 | 11 pages

Source: Powered by dataCentral

Moser Baer India (MOSR.BO)

Sell: Some Recovery in PV Business But Is it Good Enough?

- Maintain Sell PV business showed a good recovery in Q4 with ~25MW of shipments. However, the scale of the business remains small with capacity less than 200MW. Optical media showed YoY growth after four quarters of decline but EBITDA margins at ~20% are way off peak levels of ~40%. Balance sheet remains stretched (D/E is estimated at ~2x) – growth is a challenge. Risks remain high; we await more financial details in the annual report.
- SOTP-based valuation Our updated SOTP ascribes a multiple of 1.0x Sep 11E EV/S for PV business (previously 1.8x) given the sharp fall in global comps, 1.0x Sep 11E EV/S for home entertainment (unchanged) and 0.75x Sep 11E EV/Capital Employed for optical media (previously 0.7x). Our new target is Rs65.
- PV business plans lowered Revenues were ~Rs5b in FY10 (up ~70% YoY but significantly below our estimates). Management expects to emerge EBITDA positive by end-FY11. Company plans to add ~100MW Silicon capacity in FY11, which is much lower than what was envisaged earlier. We believe risks are high, as the business is small and has significant technology/execution risks.
- Optical media stable; Home entertainment still small In optical media, volumes were flat while ASPs declined ~5% in FY10. Management expects prices to remain stable in the short term. Home entertainment revenues are still small - less than 10% of standalone. We expect modest improvement in optical media in the coming years on the back of changing mix towards higher priced new formats.
- Upside risks to our stock call (1) Successful equity raising in the PV business. (2) Sharp ramp-up in PV margins. (3) Better performance in optical media than factored in our estimates. (4) Increase in crude prices which improve alternate energy viability and drive more funding towards the same.
- Transfer of coverage We are also transferring coverage of Moser Baer to Vishal Agarwal from Surendra Goyal, due to reallocation of coverage resources.

Statistica	ıl Abstract						
Year to	Net Profit	Diluted EPS	EPS growth	P/E	P/B	ROE	Yield
31 Mar	(RsM)	(Rs)	(%)	(x)	(x)	(%)	(%)
2008A	-2,023	-12.05	na	-5.5	0.5	-9.5	1.5
2009A	-4,505	-26.76	-122.1	-2.5	0.5	-20.9	0.9
2010E	-2,648	-15.73	41.2	-4.2	0.6	-13.4	1.2
2011E	-878	-5.22	66.8	-12.7	0.6	-4.9	1.5
2012E	176	1.04	120.0	63.3	0.6	1.0	1.9

See Appendix A-1 for Analyst Certification, Important Disclosures and non-US research analyst disclosures.

Equity Target price change

✓ Transfer of coverage

✓

3H Rs66 15
Rs66.15
11300.13
Rs65.00
-1.7%
1.5%
-0.2%
Rs11,133M
US\$241M

Price Performance (RIC: MOSR.BO, BB: MBI IN)



Vishal Agarwal +91-22-6616-2742 vishal1.agarwal@citi.com

Surendra Goyal, CFA +91-22-6631-9870 surendra.goyal@citi.com

Citi Investment Research & Analysis is a division of Citigroup Global Markets Inc. (the "Firm"), which does and seeks to do business with companies covered in its research reports. As a result, investors should be aware that the Firm may have a conflict of interest that could affect the objectivity of this report. Investors should consider this report as only a single factor in making their investment decision.

Fiscal year end 31-Mar	2008	2009	2010E	2011E	2012E
Valuation Ratios					
P/E adjusted (x)	-5.5	-2.5	-4.2	-12.7	63.3
EV/EBITDA adjusted (x)	8.1	25.7	6.9	5.2	4.3
P/BV (x)	0.5	0.5	0.6	0.6	0.6
Dividend yield (%)	1.5	0.9	1.2	1.5	1.9
Per Share Data (Rs)					
EPS adjusted	-12.05	-26.76	-15.73	-5.22	1.04
EPS reported	-12.05	-26.76	-15.73	-5.22	1.04
BVPS	131.10	125.73	109.06	102.67	102.25
DPS	1.00	0.60	0.80	1.00	1.25
Profit & Loss (RsM)					
Net sales	20,700	24,730	25,611	29,465	33,838
Operating expenses	-21,649	-28,558	-27,204	-28,998	-31,947
EBIT	-949	-3,828	-1,592	467	1,891
Net interest expense	-1,006	-713	-1,110	-1,372	-1,710
Non-operating/exceptionals	-45	-37	0	0	0
Pre-tax profit	-2,000	-4,578	-2,702	-906	181
Tax	-23	73	54	27	-5
Extraord./Min.Int./Pref.div.	0	0	0	0	0
Reported net income	-2,023	-4,505	-2,648	-878	176
Adjusted earnings	-2,023	-4,505	-2,648	-878	176
Adjusted EBITDA	3,509	1,289	4,893	6,224	7,766
Growth Rates (%)					
Sales	4.3	19.5	3.6	15.0	14.8
EBIT adjusted	-168.8	-303.3	58.4	129.3	305.1
EBITDA adjusted	-29.3	-63.3	279.6	27.2	24.8
EPS adjusted	-357.5	-122.1	41.2	66.8	120.0
Cash Flow (RsM)					
Operating cash flow	1,911	-1,119	5,876	6,860	8,003
Depreciation/amortization	4,458	5,117	6,485	5,757	5,875
Net working capital	-1,533	-2,353	930	609	242
Investing cash flow	-11,210	-1,847	-393	-3,824	-5,895
Capital expenditure	-9,410	-6,069	-1,893	-5,324	-7,395
Acquisitions/disposals	0	0	0	0	0
Financing cash flow	14,812	1,515	233	931	1,544
Borrowings	13,340	1,456	3,000	4,000	5,000
Dividends paid	-197	-118	-158	-197	-246
Change in cash	5,513	-1,451	5,716	3,967	3,652
Balance Sheet (RsM)					
Total assets	59,788	62,171	62,518	66,111	71,752
Cash & cash equivalent	8,210	7,626	13,342	17,309	20,961
Accounts receivable	3,768	4,071	4,070	4,521	5,099
Net fixed assets	33,490	34,683	30,092	29,659	31,179
Total liabilities	37,780	41,008	44,161	48,829	54,541
Accounts payable	5,846	7,710	7,863	8,531	9,243
Total Debt	31,842	33,298	36,298	40,298	45,298
Shareholders' funds	22,008	21,163	18,357	17,282	17,212
Profitability/Solvency Ratios (%)					
EBITDA margin adjusted	17.0	5.2	19.1	21.1	23.0
ROE adjusted	-9.5	-20.9	-13.4	-4.9	1.0
ROIC adjusted	-2.5	-8.6	-3.6	1.3	4.8
Net debt to equity	107.4	121.3	125.1	133.0	141.4
Total debt to capital	59.1	61.1	66.4	70.0	72.5

For further data queries on Citi's full coverage universe please contact CIR Data Services Asia Pacific at CIRDataServicesAsiaPacific@citi.com or +852-2501-2791



We are building in improvements in ASPs over the next few years as new formats (Blu Ray etc.) ramp up

Optical Media business

The optical media business had a slow Q4FY10 with sales volume up $\sim 3\%$ QoQ but ASPs down $\sim 4\%$ QoQ. Management expects prices to remain stable in the short term as demand migrates to new and higher value formats. We have built in increasing ASPs (mix change with migration towards new formats) into our forecasts for the next few years.

Figure 1. Key assumptions - Optical media

	FY08	FY09	FY10E	FY11E	FY12E
Optical media					
Revenue (US\$ m)	417	387	371	423	469
Volume break-up (m)	•	·	·	·	
Total	2,689	3,031	3,050	3,137	3,243
- CDs	1,620	1,670	1,600	1,520	1,444
- DVDs	1,063	1,352	1,433	1,577	1,734
- Others	6	9	17	40	65
ASP (US\$)					
Average	0.15	0.13	0.12	0.13	0.14
- CDs	0.13	0.10	0.08	0.08	0.08
- DVDs	0.18	0.14	0.12	0.11	0.11
- Others	5.00	4.00	3.65	3.20	2.40

Source: Company Reports and CIRA Estimates

Home Entertainment business

According to the management, the home entertainment business is less than 10% of stand-alone revenues. It further indicated that in Q4 the business was EBITDA positive but EBIT neutral.

The fall in content prices is a significant positive over the long term, as per the management. Moser Baer is expected to launch over 100 Blu Ray titles, which will improve realizations. Super-DVD (multiple movies in one DVD) will continue to drive volumes in this segment.

PV business

Management has not disclosed consolidated quarterly numbers (i.e. including the PV subsidiary). Revenues from this business in Q4 were ~Rs2bn while the company did ~Rs5bn in FY10 – as per the management. We await more details in the annual report.

Silicon still the big driver of the PV business

Silicon Line

- Shipments of 19.5MW achieved during Q4.
- Current capacity at 90MW with plans to reach ~190MW by FY11.

Thin Film

- Sales of 6.5MW recorded during Q4.
- Current capacity at 40MW.

The PV business is still in a ramp-up phase and it is difficult to determine growth/profitability. We believe risks remain high in the business, as the business is small and has significant technology risks.

The key PV business assumptions are highlighted below. Our numbers are largely in-line with management forecasts. We derive our margin forecasts from the global players. On the Silicon side, most companies (notably, SunTech & SunPower) have EBIT margins of \sim 7-9% and depreciation of \sim 4-5%. Our numbers build in an expansion in capacity – which will depend on the ability to fund growth – debt equity remains high at \sim 2x (our estimates - including FCCB).

Figure 2. Key assumptions – PV business

	FY08	FY09	FY10E	FY11E	FY12E
Overall Solar Business					
Revenue (US\$ m)	42.4	73.4	106.4	171.7	236.8
EBITDA margin (%)	-35.7%	5.0%	17.8%	19.7%	21.7%
EBITDA (US\$ m)	-15.1	3.7	18.9	33.8	51.4
Si-based					
Average capacity (MW)	20	80	85	140	220
Utilization (%)	65.0%	37.5%	40.0%	45.0%	45.0%
Total output (MW)	13.0	30.0	34.0	63.0	99.0
ASP (US\$/MW)	3.3	2.4	2.2	2.0	1.8
Revenue (US\$ m)	42.4	73.4	74.8	124.8	176.5
EBITDA margin (%)	-35.7%	5.0%	17.5%	19.5%	21.5%
EBITDA (US\$ m)	(15.1)	3.7	13.1	24.3	37.9
Concentration					
Average capacity (MW)		2.5	22.5	40	45
Utilization (%)		0.0%	30.0%	35.0%	40.0%
Total output (MW)		0	6.75	14	18
Average price/cell (US\$)		2.0	1.8	1.6	1.5
Revenue (US\$ m)		-	12.2	22.7	26.2
EBITDA margin (%)		0.0%	16.0%	18.0%	20.0%
EBITDA (US\$ m)		-	1.9	4.1	5.2
Thin Film	·		·	·	
Average capacity (MW)		20	45	50	65
Utilization (%)		0.0%	20.0%	25.0%	30.0%
Total output (MW)		0	9	12.5	19.5
Average price/cell (US\$)		2.4	2.16	1.944	1.7496
Revenue (US\$ m)		-	19.4	24.3	34.1
EBITDA margin (%)		0.0%	20.0%	22.0%	24.0%
EBITDA (US\$ m)			3.9	5.3	8.2

Source: Company Reports and CIRA Estimates

Q4FY10 results

Stand-alone revenues at Rs5.3bn were up \sim 12% YoY. Though the EBITDA margins were at \sim 20%, EBIT was negative for the quarter. Due to high other income, profits were Rs63m. The company made the following changes in Q4: (1) Entertainment business was moved into the wholly-owned subsidiary. (2) PV assets were moved from the stand-alone business to the PV subsidiary.

We are building in a good pick up in the PV business over the next two years

EBITDA margins at 20% - some improvement but way off the peak levels of ${\sim}40\%$

Figure 3. Q4FY10 results (stand-alone)

Rs m	4009	3Q10	4Q10	QoQ	YoY
Net Sales	4,699	5,398	5,273	-2 %	12%
CoGS	2,429	2,660	2,745	3%	13%
Staff Cost	529	601	542	-10%	2%
Other expenditure	1,100	908	954	5%	-13%
Total expenditure	4,057	4,169	4,241	2%	5%
EBITDA	642	1,229	1,032	-16%	61%
EBITDA margin (%)	13.7%	22.8%	19.6%	-318bp	592bp
Depreciation	1,417	1,210	1,161	-4%	-18%
EBIT	-775	19	-128	-778%	-83%
EBIT margin (%)	-16.5%	0.4%	-2.4%	-278bp	1407bp
Other Income	500	552	657	19%	31%
Interest	273	447	466	4%	71%
Profit before Tax	-548	125	63	-50%	-111%
Tax	0	0	0	NA	NA
Others/Prior period item	978	-93	0	-100%	-100%
Profit after Tax	429	32	63	95%	-85%

Source: Company Reports

Earnings revisions

Figure 4. Earnings revision table

FYE	Net Profit	EPS	%	DPS
31 Mar	(RsM)	(Rs)	chg	(Rs)
2010E	-2,648	-15.73	-850.2	0.80
Prev	352	2.10		1.00
2011E	-878	-5.22	-129.7	1.00
Prev	2,950	17.57		1.00
2012E	176	1.04	na	1.25
Prev	na	na		na

Source: Citi Investment Research and Analysis estimates

Sharp revision in estimates given slower ramp-up and difficult business environment

Figure 5. SOTP valuation table

Optical Media	
EV/Capital Employed	0.8x
Sep'11E Capital employed (Rs m)	29,219
EV (Rs m)	21,914
Photo Voltaic Business	
EV/Sales	1.0x
Sep'11E Sales (Rs m)	8,993
EV (Rs m)	8,993
Home entertainment	
EV/Sales	1.0x
Sep'11E Sales (Rs m)	2,998
EV (Rs m)	2,998
Total EV (Rs m)	33,904
Net Debt (Rs m)	22,956
Equity Value (Rs m)	10,949
Number of shares (fully diluted)	168
Value per share (Rs)	65
SOTP based target price (Rs)	65

Source: Citi Investment Research and Analysis

SOTP-based target price

We have revised our target price down to Rs65 (from Rs99), based on:

- We value the optical media business at 0.75x Sep 11E EV/Capital employed (previously 0.7x FY10E). This is primarily due to some improved prospects in the industry with migration to higher-value formats.
- We value the PV business at 1.0x Sep 11E EV/Sales (previously 1.8x FY10E), a ~20% premium to pure cell and module players, despite Moser's lack of operating history in this business and delays in ramp-ups. This is primarily to account for the fact that Moser has a presence in the thin-film space where multiples are higher.
- We value the home entertainment business at 1.0x Sep 11E EV/Sales (previously 1.0x FY10E). We believe this multiple is fair, given the slower growth and low profitability of the business.

Figure 6. Solar Global – Comparative valuation table

Company	RIC	Rating	MCap	CMP	P/E (x)		EV/EBITDA	(x)	EV/Sales	(x)
	Code	_	(\$ m)	(\$)	CY10E	CY11E	CY10E	CY11E	CY10E	CY11E
Poly silicon producers										
MEMC	WFR.N	2\$	2,533	11.14	40.6	8.2	7.6	3.6	1.4	1.2
Wacker	WCHG.DE	1H	7,727	148.16	13.3	10.2	5.6	4.8	1.4	1.3
Average					27.0	9.2	6.6	4.2	1.4	1.2
Cell and module makers										
SunPower	SPWRA.0	2S	786	14.19	10.9	8.9	6.2	4.9	0.8	0.5
Qcell	QCEG.DE	2S	690	7.62	-36.4	41.0	9.8	7.3	1.0	0.9
Motech Industries	6244.TW0	1M	1,168	3.10	14.2	11.6	8.9	7.4	1.2	1.0
SunTech	STP.N		1,710	9.49	16.6	11.7	7.8	6.9	1.0	1.0
Average					1.3	18.3	8.2	6.6	1.0	0.8
Thin film makers										
First Solar	FSLR.0	2S	10,299	120.75	16.2	15.8	10.5	9.1	3.7	2.6
Energy Conversion*	ENER.O	2S	206	4.50	-2.4	-5.4	-18.1	6.7	0.7	0.4
Average					6.9	5.2	-3.8	7.9	2.2	1.5
Integrated players										
REC*	REC.OL	2H	2,830	2.84	37.5	28.6	6.7	6.4	1.7	1.6
SolarWorld	SWVG.DE	2H	1,392	12.46	18.8	11.4	6.9	5.4	1.3	0.9
Average					28.1	20.0	6.8	5.9	1.5	1.3

Source: Citi Investment Research and Analysis estimates; Priced as on 24-Jun-2010

Risks remain high given the funding challenges, we await on the sidelines – remain Sellers.

Risks to our call

- Equity raising in the PV business: Successful equity raising in the PV business, at a good price, could be a possible trigger for stock-price outperformance.
- Ramp-up in PV margins: We have modeled our volume forecasts to be largely in-line with management's expectations. A sharp ramp-up in margins in the PV business remains an upside risk.
- Sharp turnaround in optical media: We build in margin improvement to our optical media forecasts but a sharper turnaround in this business remains an upside risk to our call.
- Sharp increase in oil prices which increases the viability of alternate energy and drives more funding towards the same. Moser Baer stock did very well (like most PV stocks) when crude was at high levels.

Moser Baer India

Company description

Moser Baer has interests in optical media, home entertainment and solar energy. It is the world's second-largest manufacturer of optical storage media with a significant market share - with most of the largest OEMs among its customers. Photovoltaic cells and module (PV) is a new business for which Moser has aggressive ramp-up plans. It has also forayed into home entertainment with an eye on increased penetration in the VCD/DVD market in India, which should help ASPs for its optical discs.

Investment strategy

We rate Moser Baer Sell/High Risk (3H). Despite a significant market share in the optical media business, Moser Baer has suffered a reduction in profitability due to a sharp price reduction of optical media and price escalation in its key raw material - polycarbonate (PC). We expect this business to grow ~3% YoY over FY10-12E in volume terms, with profitability improving over a longer term as PC prices ease. PV is a relatively new business. Government incentives should continue to drive demand globally, but pricing and profitability are difficult to forecast, with margins likely to face pressure from higher solar-grade silicon prices, competition from Chinese/European players and low entry barriers (particularly for cells and modules).

Valuation

Our Rs65 target price is derived from a sum-of-parts (SOTP) methodology. We value the optical media business at 0.75x Sep 11E EV/Capital employed. Over FY05-07 (prior to its venture in the PV business), Moser Baer traded at an average EV/Capital employed of 1.0x (in a 0.8-1.3x range). We believe that it will continue to trade towards the lower end as the optical media business has not improved significantly over the past few quarters. We value the PV business at 1.0x Sep 11E EV/Sales, a premium to established global cell and module PV players, despite Moser's limited operating history in this segment. We apply a premium because Moser has some capacity on thin film technology, where multiples are much higher than for cell and module PV makers. We use EV/Sales because its PV margins are difficult to forecast in a ramp-up stage with a wide divergence in margins for players in the PV industry. We value the home entertainment business at 1.0x Sep 11E EV/Sales, given its decent growth phase.

Risks

We rate Moser Baer shares High Risk, in line with our quantitative risk-rating system. We believe this is justified given the risk inherent in the optical media business and given the early stages of the company's PV and home entertainment businesses. The key upside risks to our target price are: (1) Improvements in the ASP and margins of optical media discs, (2) Improvement in margins for the solar industry, (3) Listing of the PV business, and (4) Higher crude oil prices, leading to enhanced interest in solar cell and module makers.

Appendix A-1

Analyst Certification

The research analyst(s) primarily responsible for the preparation and content of all or any identified portion of this research report hereby certifies that, with respect to each issuer or security or any identified portion of the report with respect to an issuer or security that the research analyst covers in this research report, all of the views expressed in this research report accurately reflect their personal views about those issuer(s) or securities. The research analyst(s) also certify that no part of their compensation was, is, or will be, directly or indirectly, related to the specific recommendation(s) or view(s) expressed by that research analyst in this research report.

IMPORTANT DISCLOSURES



Bin Jiang, Associate, holds a long position in the shares of SunPower Corporation.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. or its affiliates beneficially owns 1% or more of any class of common equity securities of Moser Baer India, Energy Conversion Devices Inc, Q-Cells, SunPower Corporation. This position reflects information available as of the prior business day.

Within the past 12 months, Citigroup Global Markets Inc. or its affiliates has acted as manager or co-manager of an offering of securities of SunPower Corporation.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. or its affiliates has received compensation for investment banking services provided within the past 12 months from Moser Baer India, Q-Cells. SunPower Corporation.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. or an affiliate received compensation for products and services other than investment banking services from Moser Baer India, Motech Industries. First Solar, Inc., Q-Cells, SunPower Corporation, Suntech Power, SolarWorld AG, MEMC Electronic Materials Inc in the past 12 months.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. currently has, or had within the past 12 months, the following as investment banking client(s): Moser Baer India, Q-Cells, SunPower Corporation.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. currently has, or had within the past 12 months, the following as clients, and the services provided were non-investment-banking, securities-related: Moser Baer India, First Solar, Inc., Suntech Power, MEMC Electronic Materials Inc.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. currently has, or had within the past 12 months, the following as clients, and the services provided were non-investment-banking, non-securities-related: Moser Baer India, Motech Industries, First Solar, Inc., Q-Cells, SunPower Corporation, Suntech Power, SolarWorld AG, MEMC Electronic Materials Inc.

Rohini Malkani has in the past worked with the India government or its divisions in her personal capacity.

Analysts' compensation is determined based upon activities and services intended to benefit the investor clients of Citigroup Global Markets Inc. and its affiliates ("the Firm"). Like all Firm employees, analysts receive compensation that is impacted by overall firm profitability which includes investment banking revenues.

The Firm is a market maker in the publicly traded equity securities of Energy Conversion Devices Inc, First Solar, Inc., SunPower Corporation.

For important disclosures (including copies of historical disclosures) regarding the companies that are the subject of this Citi Investment Research & Analysis product ("the Product"), please contact Citi Investment Research & Analysis, 388 Greenwich Street, 28th Floor, New York, NY, 10013, Attention: Legal/Compliance. In addition, the same important disclosures, with the exception of the Valuation and Risk assessments and historical disclosures, are contained on the Firm's disclosure website at www.citigroupgeo.com. Valuation and Risk assessments can be found in the text of the most recent research note/report regarding the subject company. Historical disclosures (for up to the past three years) will be provided upon request.

Citi Investment Research & Analysis Ratings Distribution			
Data current as of 31 Mar 2010	Buy	Hold	Sell
Citi Investment Research & Analysis Global Fundamental Coverage	51%	36%	14%
% of companies in each rating category that are investment banking clients	48%	46%	39%

Guide to Citi Investment Research & Analysis (CIRA) Fundamental Research Investment Ratings:

CIRA's stock recommendations include a risk rating and an investment rating.

Risk ratings, which take into account both price volatility and fundamental criteria, are: Low (L), Medium (M), High (H), and Speculative (S).

Investment ratings are a function of CIRA's expectation of total return (forecast price appreciation and dividend yield within the next 12 months) and risk rating.

For securities in developed markets (US, UK, Europe, Japan, and Australia/New Zealand), investment ratings are:Buy (1) (expected total return of 10% or more for Low-Risk stocks, 15% or more for Medium-Risk stocks, 20% or more for High-Risk stocks, and 35% or more for Speculative stocks); Hold (2) (0%-10% for Low-Risk stocks, 0%-15% for Medium-Risk stocks, 0%-20% for High-Risk stocks, and 0%-35% for Speculative stocks); and Sell (3) (negative total return).

For securities in emerging markets (Asia Pacific, Emerging Europe/Middle East/Africa, and Latin America), investment ratings are:Buy (1) (expected total return of 15% or more for Low-Risk stocks, 20% or more for Medium-Risk stocks, 30% or more for High-Risk stocks, and 40% or more for Speculative stocks); Hold (2) (5%-15% for Low-Risk stocks, 10%-20% for Medium-Risk stocks, 15%-30% for High-Risk stocks, and 20%-40% for Speculative stocks); and Sell (3) (5% or less for Low-Risk stocks, 10% or less for Medium-Risk stocks, 15% or less for High-Risk stocks, and 20% or less for Speculative stocks).

Investment ratings are determined by the ranges described above at the time of initiation of coverage, a change in investment and/or risk rating, or a change in target price (subject to limited management discretion). At other times, the expected total returns may fall outside of these ranges because of market price movements and/or other short-term volatility or trading patterns. Such interim deviations from specified ranges will be permitted but will become subject to review by Research Management. Your decision to buy or sell a security should be based upon your personal investment objectives and should be made only after evaluating the stock's expected performance and risk.

Guide to Citi Investment Research & Analysis (CIRA) Corporate Bond Research Credit Opinions and Investment Ratings: CIRA's corporate bond research issuer publications include a fundamental credit opinion of Improving, Stable or Deteriorating and a complementary risk rating of Low (L), Medium (M), High (H) or Speculative (S) regarding the credit risk of the company featured in the report. The fundamental credit opinion reflects the CIRA analyst's opinion of the direction of credit fundamentals of the issuer without respect to securities market vagaries. The fundamental credit opinion is not geared to, but should be viewed in the context of debt ratings issued by major public debt ratings companies such as Moody's Investors Service, Standard and Poor's, and Fitch Ratings. CBR risk ratings are approximately equivalent to the following matrix: Low Risk Triple A to Low Double A; Low to Medium Risk High Single A through High Triple B; Medium to High Risk Mid Triple B through High Double B; High to Speculative Risk Mid Double B and Below. The risk rating element illustrates the analyst's opinion of the relative likelihood of loss of principal when a fixed income security issued by a company is held to maturity, based upon both fundamental and market risk factors. Certain reports published by CIRA will also include investment ratings on specific issues of companies under coverage which have been assigned fundamental credit opinions and risk ratings. Investment ratings are a function of CIRA's expectations for total return, relative return (to publicly available Citigroup bond indices performance), and risk rating. These investment ratings are: Buy/Overweight the bond is expected to outperform the relevant Citigroup bond market sector index (Broad Investment Grade, High Yield Market or Emerging Market), performances of which are updated monthly and can be viewed at https://fidirect.citigroup.com/ using the "Indexes" tab; Hold/Neutral Weight the bond is expected to perform in line with the relevant Citigroup bond market

NON-US RESEARCH ANALYST DISCLOSURES

Non-US research analysts who have prepared this report (i.e., all research analysts listed below other than those identified as employed by Citigroup Global Markets Inc.) are not registered/qualified as research analysts with FINRA. Such research analysts may not be associated persons of the member organization and therefore may not be subject to the NYSE Rule 472 and NASD Rule 2711 restrictions on communications with a subject company, public appearances and trading securities held by a research analyst account. The legal entities employing the authors of this report are listed below:

Citigroup Global Markets India Private Limited

Vishal Agarwal, Surendra Goyal, CFA

OTHER DISCLOSURES

The subject company's share price set out on the front page of this Product is quoted as at 24 June 2010 01:09 PM on the issuer's primary market.

Citigroup Global Markets Inc. or its affiliates beneficially owns 2% or more of any class of common equity securities of Moser Baer India.

For securities recommended in the Product in which the Firm is not a market maker, the Firm is a liquidity provider in the issuers' financial instruments and may act as principal in connection with such transactions. The Firm is a regular issuer of traded financial instruments linked to securities that may have been recommended in the Product. The Firm regularly trades in the securities of the issuer(s) discussed in the Product. The Firm may engage in securities transactions in a manner inconsistent with the Product and, with respect to securities covered by the Product, will buy or sell from customers on a principal basis.

Securities recommended, offered, or sold by the Firm: (i) are not insured by the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation; (ii) are not deposits or other obligations of any insured depository institution (including Citibank); and (iii) are subject to investment risks, including the possible loss of the principal amount invested. Although information has been obtained from and is based upon sources that the Firm believes to be reliable, we do not guarantee its accuracy and it may be incomplete and condensed. Note, however, that the Firm has taken all reasonable steps to determine the accuracy and completeness of the disclosures made in the Important Disclosures section of the Product. The Firm's research department has received assistance from the subject company(ies) referred to in this Product including, but not limited to, discussions with management of the subject company(ies). Firm policy prohibits research analysts from sending draft research to subject companies. However, it should be presumed that the author of the Product has had discussions with the subject company to ensure factual accuracy prior to publication. All opinions, projections and estimates constitute the judgment of the author as of the date of the Product and these, plus any other information contained in the Product, are subject to change without notice. Prices and availability of financial instruments also are subject to change without notice. Notwithstanding other departments within the Firm advising the companies discussed in this Product, information obtained in such role is not used in the preparation of the Product. Although Citi Investment Research & Analysis (CIRA) does not set a predetermined frequency for publication, if the Product is a fundamental research report, it is the intention of CIRA to provide research coverage of the/those issuer(s) mentioned therein, including in response to news affecting this issuer, subject to applicable quiet periods and capacity constraints. The Product is for informational purposes only and is n

Investing in non-U.S. securities, including ADRs, may entail certain risks. The securities of non-U.S. issuers may not be registered with, nor be subject to the reporting requirements of the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission. There may be limited information available on foreign securities. Foreign companies are generally not subject to uniform audit and reporting standards, practices and requirements comparable to those in the U.S. Securities of some foreign companies may be less liquid and their prices more volatile than securities of comparable U.S. companies. In addition, exchange rate movements may have an adverse effect on the value of an investment in a foreign stock and its corresponding dividend payment for U.S. investors. Net dividends to ADR investors are estimated, using withholding tax rates conventions, deemed accurate, but investors are urged to consult their tax advisor for exact dividend computations. Investors who have received the Product from the Firm may be prohibited in

certain states or other jurisdictions from purchasing securities mentioned in the Product from the Firm. Please ask your Financial Consultant for additional details. Citigroup Global Markets Inc. takes responsibility for the Product in the United States. Any orders by US investors resulting from the information contained in the Product may be placed only through Citigroup Global Markets Inc.

Important Disclosures for Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC Customers: Morgan Stanley & Co. Incorporated (Morgan Stanley) research reports may be available about the companies that are the subject of this Citi Investment Research & Analysis (CIRA) research report. Ask your Financial Advisor or use smithbarney.com to view any available Morgan Stanley research reports in addition to CIRA research reports.

Important disclosure regarding the relationship between the companies that are the subject of this CIRA research report and Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC and its affiliates are available at the Morgan Stanley Smith Barney disclosure website at www.morganstanleysmithbarney.com/researchdisclosures.

The required disclosures provided by Morgan Stanley and Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. on Morgan Stanley and CIRA research relate in part to the separate businesses of Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. and Morgan Stanley that now form Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC, rather than to Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC in its entirety. For Morgan Stanley and Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. specific disclosures, you may refer to www.morganstanley.com/researchdisclosures and https://www.citigroupgeo.com/geopublic/Disclosures/index a.html.

This CIRA research report has been reviewed and approved on behalf of Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC. This review and approval was conducted by the same person who reviewed this research report on behalf of CIRA. This could create a conflict of interest.

The Citigroup legal entity that takes responsibility for the production of the Product is the legal entity which the first named author is employed by. The Product is made available in Australia through Citigroup Global Markets Australia Pty Ltd. (ABN 64 003 114 832 and AFSL No. 240992), participant of the ASX Group and regulated by the Australian Securities & Investments Commission. Citigroup Centre, 2 Park Street, Sydney, NSW 2000. The Product is made available in Australia to Private Banking wholesale clients through Citigroup Pty Limited (ABN 88 004 325 080 and AFSL 238098). Citigroup Pty Limited provides all financial product advice to Australian Private Banking wholesale clients through bankers and relationship managers. If there is any doubt about the suitability of investments held in Citigroup Private Bank accounts, investors should contact the Citigroup Private Bank in Australia. Citigroup companies may compensate affiliates and their representatives for providing products and services to clients. The Product is made available in Brazil by Citigroup Global Markets Brasil - CCTVM SA, which is regulated by CVM - Comissão de Valores Mobiliários, BACEN - Brazilian Central Bank, APIMEC - Associação dos Analistas e Profissionais de Investimento do Mercado de Capitais and ANBID - Associação Nacional dos Bancos de Investimento. Av. Paulista, 1111 - 11º andar - CEP. 01311920 - São Paulo - SP. If the Product is being made available in certain provinces of Canada by Citigroup Global Markets (Canada) Inc. ("CGM Canada"), CGM Canada has approved the Product. Citigroup Place, 123 Front Street West, Suite 1100, Toronto, Ontario M5J 2M3. The Product is made available in France by Citigroup Global Markets Limited, which is authorised and regulated by Financial Services Authority. 1-5 Rue Paul Cézanne, 8ème, Paris, France. The Product may not be distributed to private clients in Germany. The Product is distributed in Germany by Citigroup Global Markets Deutschland AG & Co. KGaA, which is regulated by Bundesanstalt fuer Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin). Frankfurt am Main, Reuterweg 16, 60323 Frankfurt am Main. If the Product is made available in Hong Kong by, or on behalf of, Citigroup Global Markets Asia Ltd., it is attributable to Citigroup Global Markets Asia Ltd., Citibank Tower, Citibank Plaza, 3 Garden Road, Hong Kong. Citigroup Global Markets Asia Ltd. is regulated by Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission. If the Product is made available in Hong Kong by The Citigroup Private Bank to its clients, it is attributable to Citibank N.A., Citibank Tower, Citibank Plaza, 3 Garden Road, Hong Kong. The Citigroup Private Bank and Citibank N.A. is regulated by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority. The Product is made available in India by Citigroup Global Markets India Private Limited, which is regulated by Securities and Exchange Board of India. Bakhtawar, Nariman Point, Mumbai 400-021. The Product is made available in Indonesia through PT Citigroup Securities Indonesia. 5/F, Citibank Tower, Bapindo Plaza, Jl. Jend. Sudirman Kav. 54-55, Jakarta 12190. Neither this Product nor any copy hereof may be distributed in Indonesia or to any Indonesian citizens wherever they are domiciled or to Indonesian residents except in compliance with applicable capital market laws and regulations. This Product is not an offer of securities in Indonesia. The securities referred to in this Product have not been registered with the Capital Market and Financial Institutions Supervisory Agency (BAPEPAM-LK) pursuant to relevant capital market laws and regulations, and may not be offered or sold within the territory of the Republic of Indonesia or to Indonesian citizens through a public offering or in circumstances which constitute an offer within the meaning of the Indonesian capital market laws and regulations. The Product is made available in Israel through Citibank NA, regulated by the Bank of Israel and the Israeli Securities Authority, Citibank, N.A. Platinum Building, 21 Ha'arba'ah St, Tel Aviv, Israel. The Product is made available in Italy by Citigroup Global Markets Limited, which is authorised and regulated by Financial Services Authority. Foro Buonaparte 16, Milan, 20121, Italy. The Product is made available in Japan by Citigroup Global Markets Japan Inc. ("CGMJ"), which is regulated by Financial Services Agency, Securities and Exchange Surveillance Commission, Japan Securities Dealers Association, Tokyo Stock Exchange and Osaka Securities Exchange. Shin-Marunouchi Building, 1-5-1 Marunouchi, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-6520 Japan. If the Product was distributed by Nikko Cordial Securities Inc. it is being so distributed under license. In the event that an error is found in an CGMJ research report, a revised version will be posted on the Firm's Global Equities Online (GEO) website. If you have questions regarding GEO, please call (81 3) 6270-3019 for help. The Product is made available in Korea by Citigroup Global Markets Korea Securities Ltd., which is regulated by Financial Services Commission and the Financial Supervisory Service. Hungkuk Life Insurance Building, 226 Shinmunno 1-GA, Jongno-Gu, Seoul, 110-061. The Product is made available in Malaysia by Citigroup Global Markets Malaysia Sdn Bhd. which is regulated by Malaysia Securities Commission. Menara Citibank. 165 Jalan Ampang, Kuala Lumpur, 50450. The Product is made available in Mexico by Acciones y Valores Banamex, S.A. De C. V., Casa de Bolsa, Integrante del Grupo Financiero Banamex ("Accival") which is a wholly owned subsidiary of Citigroup Inc. and is regulated by Comision Nacional Bancaria y de Valores. Reforma 398, Col. Juarez, 06600 Mexico, D.F. In New Zealand the Product is made available through Citigroup Global Markets New Zealand Ltd. (Company Number 604457), a Participant of the New Zealand Exchange Limited and regulated by the New Zealand Securities Commission. Level 19. Mobile on the Park, 157 Lambton Quay, Wellington, The Product is made available in Pakistan by Citibank N.A. Pakistan branch, which is regulated by the State Bank of Pakistan and Securities Exchange Commission, Pakistan. AWT Plaza, 1.1. Chundrigar Road, P.O. Box 4889, Karachi-74200. The Product is made available in Poland by Dom Maklerski Banku Handlowego SA an indirect subsidiary of Citigroup Inc., which is regulated by Komisja Nadzoru Finansowego. Dom Maklerski Banku Handlowego S.A. ul. Chalubinskiego 8, 00-630 Warszawa. The Product is made available in the Russian Federation through ZAO Citibank, which is licensed to carry out banking activities in the Russian Federation in accordance with the general banking license issued by the Central Bank of the Russian Federation and brokerage activities in accordance with the license issued by the Federal Service for Financial Markets. Neither the Product nor any information contained in the Product shall be considered as advertising the securities mentioned in this report within the territory of the Russian Federation or outside the Russian Federation. The Product does not constitute an appraisal within the meaning of the Federal Law of the Russian Federation of 29 July 1998 No. 135-FZ (as amended) On Appraisal Activities in the Russian Federation. 8-10 Gasheka Street, 125047 Moscow. The Product is made available in Singapore through Citigroup Global Markets Singapore Pte. Ltd., a Capital Markets Services Licence holder, and regulated by Monetary Authority of Singapore. 1 Temasek Avenue, #39-02 Millenia Tower, Singapore 039192. The Product is made available by The Citigroup Private Bank in Singapore through Citibank, N.A., Singapore branch, a licensed bank in Singapore that is regulated by Monetary Authority of Singapore. Citigroup Global Markets (Pty) Ltd. is incorporated in the Republic of South Africa (company registration number 2000/025866/07) and its registered office is at 145 West Street, Sandton, 2196, Saxonwold. Citigroup Global Markets (Pty) Ltd. is regulated by JSE Securities Exchange South Africa, South African Reserve Bank and the Financial Services Board. The investments and services contained herein are not available to private customers in South Africa. The Product is made available in Spain by Citigroup Global Markets Limited, which is authorised and regulated by Financial Services Authority. 29 Jose Ortega Y Gassef, 4th Floor, Madrid, 28006, Spain. The Product is made available in Taiwan through Citigroup Global Markets Taiwan Securities Company Ltd., which is regulated by Securities & Futures Bureau. No portion of the report may be reproduced or quoted in Taiwan by the press or any other person. No. 1, Songzhi Road,

24 June 2010

Taipei 110, Taiwan. The Product is made available in Thailand through Citicorp Securities (Thailand) Ltd., which is regulated by the Securities and Exchange Commission of Thailand. 18/F, 22/F and 29/F, 82 North Sathorn Road, Silom, Bangrak, Bangkok 10500, Thailand. The Product is made available in Turkey through Citibank AS which is regulated by Capital Markets Board. Tekfen Tower, Eski Buyukdere Caddesi # 209 Kat 2B, 23294 Levent, Istanbul, Turkey. In the U.A.E, these materials (the "Materials") are communicated by Citigroup Global Markets Limited, DIFC branch ("CGML"), an entity registered in the Dubai International Financial Center ("DIFC") and licensed and regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority ("DFSA" to Professional Clients and Market Counterparties only and should not be relied upon or distributed to Retail Clients, A distribution of the different CIRA ratings distribution, in percentage terms for Investments in each sector covered is made available on request. Financial products and/or services to which the Materials relate will only be made available to Professional Clients and Market Counterparties. The Product is made available in United Kingdom by Citigroup Global Markets Limited, which is authorised and regulated by Financial Services Authority. This material may relate to investments or services of a person outside of the UK or to other matters which are not regulated by the FSA and further details as to where this may be the case are available upon request in respect of this material. Citigroup Centre, Canada Square, Canary Wharf, London, E14 5LB. The Product is made available in United States by Citigroup Global Markets Inc, which is regulated by FINRA and the US Securities and Exchange Commission. 388 Greenwich Street, New York, NY 10013. Unless specified to the contrary, within EU Member States, the Product is made available by Citigroup Global Markets Limited, which is regulated by Financial Services Authority. Many European regulators require that a firm must establish, implement and make available a policy for managing conflicts of interest arising as a result of publication or distribution of investment research. The policy applicable to CIRA's Products can be found at www.citigroupgeo.com. Compensation of equity research analysts is determined by equity research management and Citigroup's senior management and is not linked to specific transactions or recommendations. The Product may have been distributed simultaneously, in multiple formats, to the Firm's worldwide institutional and retail customers. The Product is not to be construed as providing investment services in any jurisdiction where the provision of such services would not be permitted. Subject to the nature and contents of the Product, the investments described therein are subject to fluctuations in price and/or value and investors may get back less than originally invested. Certain high-volatility investments can be subject to sudden and large falls in value that could equal or exceed the amount invested. Certain investments contained in the Product may have tax implications for private customers whereby levels and basis of taxation may be subject to change. If in doubt, investors should seek advice from a tax adviser. The Product does not purport to identify the nature of the specific market or other risks associated with a particular transaction. Advice in the Product is general and should not be construed as personal advice given it has been prepared without taking account of the objectives, financial situation or needs of any particular investor. Accordingly, investors should, before acting on the advice, consider the appropriateness of the advice, having regard to their objectives, financial situation and needs. Prior to acquiring any financial product, it is the client's responsibility to obtain the relevant offer document for the product and consider it before making a decision as to whether to purchase the product.

© 2010 Citigroup Global Markets Inc. Citi Investment Research & Analysis is a division and service mark of Citigroup Global Markets Inc. and its affiliates and is used and registered throughout the world. Citi and Citi with Arc Design are trademarks and service marks of Citigroup Inc and its affiliates and are used and registered throughout the world. All rights reserved. Any unauthorized use, duplication, redistribution or disclosure is prohibited by law and will result in prosecution. Where included in this report, MSCI sourced information is the exclusive property of Morgan Stanley Capital International Inc. (MSCI). Without prior written permission of MSCI, this information and any other MSCI intellectual property may not be reproduced, redisseminated or used to create any financial products, including any indices. This information is provided on an "as is" basis. The user assumes the entire risk of any use made of this information, MSCI, its affiliates and any third party involved in, or related to, computing or compiling the information hereby expressly disclaim all warranties of originality, accuracy, completeness, merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose with respect to any of this information. Without limiting any of the foregoing, in no event shall MSCI, any of its affiliates or any third party involved in, or related to, computing or compiling the information have any liability for any damages of any kind. MSCI, Morgan Stanley Capital International and the MSCI indexes are services marks of MSCI and its affiliates. The information contained in the Product is intended solely for the recipient and may not be further distributed by the recipient. The Firm accepts no liability whatsoever for the actions of third parties. The Product may provide the addresses of, or contain hyperlinks to, websites. Except to the extent to which the Product refers to website material of the Firm, the Firm has not reviewed the linked site. Equally, except to the extent to which the Product refers to website material of the Firm, the Firm takes no responsibility for, and makes no representations or warranties whatsoever as to, the data and information contained therein. Such address or hyperlink (including addresses or hyperlinks to website material of the Firm) is provided solely for your convenience and information and the content of the linked site does not in anyway form part of this document. Accessing such website or following such link through the Product or the website of the Firm shall be at your own risk and the Firm shall have no liability arising out of, or in connection with, any such referenced website.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE UPON REQUEST